KADRI SIREL

DE-DESIRING DANCE LANGUAGING FOR THE EMERGENCE OF DANCE THINKING

RAPHY
ORMANCE ART
CES
ODY
ERFORMANCE
OGRAPHY
RT   PERFORMANCE ART
EATRE PRACTICES
SCIPLINED BODY
EOGRAPHY
CE ART
PRACTICES
ODY
NCE
PHY
ERFORMANCE ART

DE-DESIRING DANCE LANGUAGING FOR THE EMERGENCE OF DANCE THINKING

KADRI SIREL
MA PERFORMANCE PRACTICES

HOME OF PERFORMANCE PRACTICES

2022

SYNOPSIS

The research asks how dance thinking can emerge in a language-mediated culture. While acknowledging dance and language as mediums of thought, equally capable of world-making, the project claims that Western logocentrism subjugates dance to its frames of thinking, thus, constructing dance languaging. Bound to the market, dance languaging profits from dancers' virtuosity and multidimensional attention by selling the fantasy of the ideal, multitasking neoliberal subject. With that, the project recognizes that neoliberalism has determined desire by labour-power and proposes to de-desire – a choreographic practice that, with chance operations, autobiography, and somatic practice, disorients the dancing and choreographing subjectivities' desire stuck in neoliberal predicaments and enables the emergence of dance thinking.

Dance thinking is an embodied and relational meaning-making process expected to mediate alternative (market) relations. Here, the relationship between the dancer and the dance (unfolding in the process of dancing) becomes the landscape where desire is disoriented. Furthermore, the practice of de-desiring expands the relational landscape

between the dancer and the dance between the dancer's relationship with other dancers, the environment, and the audience. The practice aims to distance the dancer from pre-given expectations, definitions, and meanings to one's encounters (with dance, dancers, environment, the audience) to mediate rhizomatic and intra-active modes of desiring where meanings of dance and, with that, the neoliberal evaluation of dancers' labour (dance languaging) can be renegotiated.

Some of the findings show that de-desiring initiates choreographic writing from within the dancing body and its relational entanglements. This occurrence evidences how dance thinking reconfigures choreographing, a form of languaging that traditionally forms and orders dances and the meaning of dance in society. In the dance performance "Holy Motors", dance thinking invited the audience to its relational field and suggested a transformation from a witness to a with-ness, where the one looking becomes entangled with the one seen. The research sees further potential in dance thinking to unstuck the concept of labour from its connotation to profit, product, and efficiency and re-think it from within the (a)live interactions that it occurs.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

DECLARATION

I, Kadri Sirel, hereby certify that I had personally carried out the work depicted in the thesis entitled "De-desiring dance languaging for the emergence of dance thinking".

No part of the thesis has been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma prior to this date.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

The autoethnographic practice-led artistic research "De-desiring dance languaging for the emergence of dance thinking" differentiates between dance languaging and dance thinking; to highlight the distinction between dancing that is contained and defined within the neoliberal capitalist value systems (dance languaging), as opposed to dancing that has the potential to distribute value alternative to its current socio-economic connotation with profit (dance thinking). Dance thinking is a term borrowed from the choreographer Eleanor Bauer, who differentiates between dance as a medium of thought and language as a medium of thought, both which have the potential to mediate and shape the world around us. She claims that thinking always happens within a medium that's frames organize experience and perception about the conditions we operate from within (Bauer, 2018: 147). The present research relies on Bauer's differentiation between dance and language being equally capable of world-making, but claims that the order of the Western logocentrism submits dance as a medium of thought to its frames. The research asks how dance thinking can emerge in a language-mediated culture to claim its agency and propose an alternative economy of signification.

Though acutely aware of the complex entanglements of processes of languaging and processes of thinking, the project situates itself in the discourse of representational and non-representational theory: dance languaging, bound to the market, profits from the dancer's multi-layered attention by selling the fantasy of the ideal, multitasking, neoliberal subject, while dance thinking refers to embodied meaning-making processes within and between dancers' bodies, verbally inarticulable in the neoliberal evaluation system. While thinking is traditionally a process conceived in the mind and emerges in relation to memory, attention, consideration, and deliberation, this research looks at dance thinking as an embodied, affective, and relational meaning-making process. Speculating dancing as a relationship between the dancer and dance (Chauchat, 2017: 29) situates thinking within the process of dancing. The research argues that a dancer's desire to dance, the meaning of dance in society, and the value of the dancer's labour are informed by one another. However, this relationality is subjugated under the neoliberal meaning- and desiring-production that determines desire by labour-power and represses dancers' labour to its evaluation criteria. The artistic research and its performance "Holy Motors" (2022) hypothesize that de-desiring the relationship between the dancer, her dance, other dancers and the audience will disorient desire stuck in neoliberal paradigm and call for the emergence of dance thinking.

The chapter "Dance languaging" contextualizes choreographic writing as a practice of choreographic choice-making that by exclusion not only makes a dance performance but also informs what dance means in society. The chapter argues that Western choreographic writing is informed by abstract labour as the social form of neoliberal capitalism (Marx in Wikström, 2019) and that its representation (dancers' virtuous and concentrated performance on the stage) aligns Western dance with the "ideal" kinetic reality of the age (Lepecki, 2006: 4). Such choreographic writing is acknowledged to instrumentalize desire as a lack or a need (Holland, 2005: 54) to affirm the neoliberal evaluation criterion. The chapter "De-desiring", through deconstruction, proposes to disorient desire captured by social representations. With chance operations, autobiography, and somatic practice, the chapter introduces the beginning of choreographing from within the dancing body, attending to the affective relationship between the dancer and her dance. That is to give agency to the dancer ('s relationship with her dance) to reconfigure choreographic writing that traditionally forms and orders dance(r)s.

By reflecting on the dance performance "Holy Motors" (2022) choreographic writing, the chapter "Dance thinking", discusses the expansion the affective, relational field between the dancer, dance, and other dancers to the audience. Dance thinking signifies attuning into that relational field

and advocates for the emergence of embodied meaning-making patterns that cannot quite be (verbally) articulated but that are felt. "Holy Motors" unfolds the communicational properties of dance thinking, by allowing discussion on the performance's audience hospitality. The research's urgency is personal and political. The dissatisfaction with my dancing body's subjection to neoliberal fantasies brings me to seek disentanglement of a dancer's labour from the definitions provided by the capitalist market. I suggest that dancers having the agency to renegotiate the value of their dancing from their relationship to dance, allows for further re-thinking the concept of labour in society from within the bodies as opposed to its constructions within the neoliberal ideology.

The research context dates to 1964, with choreographer Yvonne Rainer (2013) acknowledging that dancers' virtuous performance seduces the audience by representing a fantasy. The research bridges its context to nearly 60 years back, to evidence that while contemporary choreographic practices are making progress in resisting modes of commodification by renegotiating the process-product binary, institutional progress is never evident and needs to be reviewed from the perspective of the affective states it involves and amplifies. Critical dance theorists Bojana Kunst and André Lepecki evidence the ongoing dancers' subjection to neoliberal fantasies by claiming that dance reflects the ideal motility of the age (Lepecki, 2006: 4) that makes dancers an example

of disciplined labour (Kunst, 2017: 122). The research contributes to the field by proposing to untie desire from neoliberal fantasies. To shake the very structures of desiring would mean to keep definitions of dance moving in terms of renegotiating value systems and practices of production from within the dancer's body.

1. DANCE LANGUAGING

Dance languaging refers to the neoliberal capitalist language operating in the Western field of dance. Neoliberalism is the ideology that legitimates the capitalist machine's continuous production, consumption, and commodification of objects and subjects, while critical dance theory queries dancing to be a challenge to the neoliberal capitalist signification process. Dance, which ontologically resists the capitalist economy of objecthood by ephemerally disappearing as it appears (Lepecki, 2016: no pagination) but is practised, performed, and produced within the dance market's hierarchies, brings me to ask, how can choreography remain critical of capitalism? Cultural theorist Josefine Wikström (2019) states that the critique of capitalism in art needs to be a critique of the social form of abstract labour and that such critique must be mediated through the form (Adorno) of the artwork. Wikström's invitation inspired the thesis to seek out abstract labour, both in performance on stage but also beyond. If we radically follow through with her line of argument, ephemerality challenges the form of dance languaging and calls to intervene - as I will demonstrate – through dance thinking that is deeply bound to the artwork's form. This point will be elaborated on in chapter two.

The differentiation of abstract and concrete labour comes

from Marx's critique of capitalism, where the first refers to the efficiency of labour as value and the latter emphasises the aspect of labour being a production with an end result. According to Marx, abstract labour is capitalism's main mediating social form (Marx in Wikström, 2019). Philosopher and performance theoretician Bojana Kunst (2011: 48) recognises how the value of abstract labour as economically profitable work time has oscillated to areas of life outside of work, impacting subject formation and personal relationships. Philosopher Paolo Virno further elaborates on the performance of abstract labour in a contemporary work society, by pointing out how everybody is expected to turn into virtuoso performers, since the basis of labour is no longer the production of commodity as an end product, however, the performance of labour is the evaluation index (Virno in Bishop, 2018: 23). Critical dance theorist André Lepecki evidences the coalescence of the ideal labour performance with the display of virtuosity on dance stages, as an art form in the West that, "aligns itself with an ideal of ongoing motility" (Lepecki, 2006: 4). The ideal motility of the capitalist age is the uninterrupted flow of money, production, and organisation, reflected in the continuous, virtuous, and concentrated movement on Western dance stages.

Lepecki's recognition that the dancers are expected to perform an uninterrupted flow of movement brings me to reflect upon the expectations I have encountered in my years of training as a dancer. During my dance formation, an improvisation teacher once said that people are tired of their daily lives not going according to plan, so they come to the theatre and want to see the performers succeed in what they are doing. This statement does not intend to assume or dismiss why the audience goes to the theatre, but evidences the hidden linguistic system that measured the value of my dancing against virtuosity. Choreographer Yvonne Rainer's "No Manifesto" (2013) exposes Western theatrical dancers' virtuous performance to seduce the audience. Rainer's recognition of seduction recognises the interaction between the audience and the dancer to be a desiring one – the dancer representing something desired (a successful performance) yet difficult to possess. The interaction mediated by desire helps my argument about the dancers' virtuoso performance enacting a social representation of the ideal abstract labour. The social representation of abstract labour on Western dance stages affirms neoliberal evaluation criteria as a social standard that subjugates its citizens (including dancers) to its parameters of efficiency, multitasking, and virtuosity.

Philosopher Gilles Deleuze defines desire as the production of reality, but he states that the function of social representation is precisely to separate desire from reality. Deleuze notes how social representations inject so-called needs, scarcity, and lack so that individuals and groups believe that they lack or need something that subsequently gets taken from them by social order (Holland, 2005: 54). In my reflective journal

"Disciplinary Images" (2020), I address how desire forms subjects and produces reality in relation to labour-power:

During my first year at school, I enjoyed drawing the alphabet as precisely as I could, it made my seven-year-old self feel important. I took pleasure in people saying, "she's a good girl!". As much as the good girl mirrored my self-value, there was fear attached to it, too - while I became accustomed to being called "good", the more resented became that on the opposite, the "bad". The use of "the good girl" and "the bad girl" in an educational regime is a disciplining tool that affectively links one's identity with the evaluation of their performance (Sirel, 2020).

With evaluative categories such as "good" and "bad", identities are raised to perform in the neoliberal labour market from an early age. It promotes a state of continuous agitation that reinforces social and performance anxieties.

The research claims that dancers' virtuous performance on the stage is a social representation that affirms subject formation under neoliberal control. Furthermore, that desire is a mediating force that imbues and establishes the neoliberal labour standards. The relevance of de-desiring is to mediate alternative interactions of desiring between the audience and the dancer to renegotiate dancers' labour value and abstract labour as the social form of capitalism.

In response to Wikström's invitation to critique the social form of abstract labour through the form of the artwork, the research turns to choreography as the form-giving practise of dancing. Choreographer Eleanor Bauer says, "choreography has structured and ordered dancing for so many centuries that it has shaped how dance thinks as profoundly as writing has shaped oral language" (Bauer, 2018: 148). The following subchapters address how choreographic writing captures desire. Chapter 1.1 unfolds the grammar of choreographic writing through Deleuze and Guattari's (1987) concept of the faciality machine. Chapter 1.2 elaborates on how choreographic writing informs and is informed by abstract labour as the social form of neoliberal capitalism and explains the use of deconstruction (Derrida, 1997) as the underlying methodology of the research.

1.1 THE FACIALITY AND ABSTRACT LABOUR

Deleuze and Guattari's concept of the faciality machine will address the construction of the representation of the social form of abstract labour in dance languaging. Deleuze and Guattari define faciality within the signifying regime. It is a process through which words, symbols, signs, and other signifiers derive their meaning. The meaning is produced through the substance of their expression, namely, their faciality. The face is the visible sign at the centre of signifiance. Faciality, the essence of the face, is ultimately a dominating and dangerously compelling trait of bodies, and Deleuze

and Guattari remark that the face is a whole-body unto itself: it is like the body of the centre of signifiance to which all of the de-territorialised signs affix themselves (Delueze and Guattari in D'Errico, 2019: 359-360). The face holds power over what can be said but also limits the potential of what can be done and thought. The importance of the faciality machine within this research is to intersect the processes of signifiance (the formation of words and concepts) and the processes of subjectivation (the formation of subjectivities).

The concept of faciality illustrates how words, through the centralisation of specific signifiers and the de-territorialisation of others, derive their meaning. The imaginary line between the central visibility of some signs and de-territorial marginality of others is sided with only a specific proportion of dance labour being visible to the audience. The performance theoretician Bojana Kunst speaks about the first Lumiere film made in 1895, that depicts the workers of the Lumiere factory leaving their workplace by the end of the day. Kunst recognises workers' movement through the factory gate as crossing the imaginary line between labour and leisure time, a line that has disappeared in the contemporary post-industrial work society. Kunst claims that the "place of work is no longer in darkness, but dispersed all over" (Kunst, 2011: 48). While I agree that in today's work society, abstract labour standards have been imbued into the social fabric outside of the workplace, I argue that a large proportion of dance work takes

place in darkness. The dancers' virtuoso performance on the stage (representation of the ideal abstract labour) is visible, while the aspects of the making-of, such as choreographing, training, and rehearsing (concrete labour), remain hidden.

The research emphasises the difference of visibility between the abstract and the concrete labour in dance-making and gives ideological weight to the visibility/invisibility of the labour processes. The research claims that choreographic writing is responsible for such division. It defines choreographing as the unedited decision-making process that gives a dance form and order. Choreographing can occur momentarily or over a more extended rehearsal period, but it entails an imaginary line between the decision-making process and the product it displays. By operating from the invisible side of the line, choreographing is the faciality machine of dance making, that holds the power over which signs become central and which ones remain de-territorial from how dance in the society takes its meaning. Rainer negates phrasing, variation, rhythm, and shape - some of the choreographic techniques that form a dance and, by that very means, structure the conditions in which dancers' bodies are made visible (Wikström, 2019). Performance theoretician Peggy Phelan argues that visibility "summons surveillance and the law; it provokes voyeurism, fetishism, the colonialist/imperial appetite for possession". It is a trap, because the invisible political powers operate from behind (Phelan, 1994: 6). Here,

choreographic writing is addressed as the invisible system that constructs dance languaging, displays dancers' bodies under neoliberal evaluation of virtuosity and constructs the meaning of dance in society.

With the concepts of the signifier and the signified, linguist Ferdinand Saussure allows further elaboration on the impact of choreographic writing on the meaning of dance in society. That meaning defines the physical and mental dispositions that make one a dancer, evaluates their performance, calculates salary, employs, and further positions their identity and role within society. The signifier is the written word, image, or in this case, performance, for example, of "dancing", whereas the signified refers to the concept of dancing. The signified cannot be a real dance because people refer to different dances when speaking of dancing; however, it refers to the existence of a shared understanding of what is meant by the word "dance". Saussure claims that the signifiers and the signified are both dependent on one another and both subject to an ordering principle. He insists that it is falsely believed within logocentrism that the signifiers are only dependent on the signified, that the words, images, or pictures are one-way attached to the things they refer to, but the concepts are also dependent on the signifiers (Saussure in Derrida, 1997: 30). By forming conditions in which dance and dancers' bodies are displayed, choreographic writing informs the construction of both the signifier and the concept

of dance in Western society. That in turn informs dancers' work conditions, such as high expectations to their performance yet precarious access to social benefits.

The research uncovered that the representation of abstract labour is situated centrally, while concrete labour is de-territorialised from how dance, both as a signifier and signified, takes its meaning. The research proposes to look at their different aesthetics of motility to reason one's visibility and the other's invisibility. It was said that the representation of abstract labour on dance stages aligns with the "ideal" motility of the age (Lepecki, 2006: 4), while choreographing takes place in a motion of editing. This point is supported by Gabriele Brandstetter (2011: 121-122), professor of theatre and dance studies, who recognises how writing as the production of text does not take place in a single, dynamic movement, but includes interruption, deletion, erasure, and overwriting. Brandstetter allows us to recognise how choreographic writing also does not happen in one single movement but in a motion of undoing, redoing, overdoing, pausing, and repeating. As a mode of motility, concrete labour conflicts with the neoliberal capitalist ideal - the continuous, unstoppable flow of movement as the kinetic reality of age.

The division of abstract and concrete labour in choreographic writing points to a process-product binary in which the process of choreographic writing commodifies both the

dance performance and the dancers' bodies within it and contributes to a larger meaning-production of dance in society. That meaning reduces dancers' labour value to their appearance on the stage. The next chapter unfolds deconstruction as the primary method of working in relation to undoing desire captured by social representations. Using deconstruction, the dance performance "Holy Motors" (2022) works towards an inclusive mode of choreographic writing. The performance wishes to dismantle the division between abstract and concrete labour to speculate an alternative mode of motility, instead of working towards a product.

1.2 CHOREOGRAPHIC WRITING AND DESIRE

The faciality machine addresses a structural intersection between the processes of signification and subjectivation. As mentioned in chapter 1.1, faciality refers to the centralization of some signs and the de-territorialization of others in the greater mechanism of meaning-production within society, thus intersecting the forming of signifiers, concepts, and identities . Following the Marxian terminology of concrete and abstract labour in light of the concepts visible and invisible, the research argues that the invisible concrete labour of dance making (choreographic writing) subjugates dancers' bodies into social representations of the ideal multitasking, efficient (abstract) labour force. Furthermore, that social representation affirms subject formation under the

neoliberal evaluation. While the researcher acknowledges that the entanglement of abstract and concrete labour in the field of dance is more complex and efficient modes of production infiltrate various aspects of dance-making, the current research focuses on the process-product binary to make prevalent dancers' labour value being closely knit to the social representation it produces.

Social representations produce meaning. The violence of that meaning production is evidenced by how socially acceptable meanings within neoliberal ideology can be just one . Such language application is a disciplining system that evaluates subjects and objects against social representations determined by labour value and profit, and represses the possibility for meanings to manifest on a plurality of simultaneous open sets of trajectories. Philosopher Jacques Derrida attributes the repression of polysemantic meanings to the history of the world being logocentric, assuming that there is truth to be found through language. According to Derrida, that's problematic because words cannot be pinned down to just one meaning. The limiting of meaning happens between the entanglements of the linguistic system and social paradigm. He elaborates that bureaucracies and social institutions are held together by a theory of language, a system of words, sentences that bundled together become the foundation, the power that the institution is. Derrida defines such a system as something that organizes meaning before

meaning is put into place and claims that the underlying structure that organizes meaning within a paradigm is its grammar (Derrida, 1997). Grammar allows meanings to take shape but also makes error and deviance possible.

In the field of dance, the paradigm's grammar manifests in the form of choreographic writing that divides signs into those that become part of the faciality of dance language and those that remain excluded from it. The division produces meaning because it distributes value. The poet Lisa Robertson says, "what an economy distributes, we call value, and what it rejects, we call garbage" (Robertson in Kunst, 2017: 121). However, in between garbage and value, there is devalue, a reduction of dancers' labour value by equating it with desirability. The performance theoretician Peggy Phelan's argument that visibility calls for fetishization (Phelan, 1994: 6) allows the present research to argue that choreographic writing (the invisible political power behind dance language) makes dancers the objects of desire and perpetuates a desire to be desired to affirm their value. The recognition of the desire to be desired refers to my experience as a dancer. The economy doesn't distribute value to dancer's labour; the job is precarious in terms of employment, salary, and social benefits. However, what it doesn't value monetarily, it pays in desirability .

Nevertheless, this desirability is a trap because placing my value in desirability makes me powerless to question the very system that affirms it. Here unfold the power dynamics in which such distribution of value takes place and draws attention to how it distracts seeking my dancing's agency beyond neoliberal control. Within the Schizosomatics Elective blog, I wrote:

As a dancer, I find myself desiring to threaten capitalism without really threatening it because I also want to be looked at. I want recognition for my skills. I desire to hear that I am a "good "dancer. I also recognize being stuck with my thoughts bouncing back and forth in this unescapable loop between desiring to claim the agency of my dancing as the overthrowing of neoliberal capitalism while knowing that by doing so, I will lose my desirability (Sirel, 2022).

Desirability as a value informs the process of subjectivation within neoliberalism. Furthermore, it is a dangerous and misleading promise that needs disorientation.

I admit to being hopelessly looped within neoliberal modes of self-production. Which is why, my thinking, desiring, dancing, and choreographing need disorienting (Sirel, 2022).

Deconstruction calls disorientation into my choreographing and dancing body to disentangle desire from the imprints

of neoliberal social representations and allow desiring on multiple trajectories. Here, deconstruction relies on the understanding that desire is captive within the established abstract labour standards. However, other modes of desiring can evolve when taking these structures apart. De-desiring deconstructs my choreographic writing by means of chance operations, autobiography, and fascia-work (see next chapter) to facilitate alternative interactions of desiring between the dancer and audience and to challenge abstract labour as the social form of neoliberal capitalism.

2. DE-DESIRING

Previously I defined choreographic writing as a practice of choice-making that decides how dance will be displayed and that holds power over how contemporary stage dance is perceived in Western society. De-desiring is a choreographic method that aims to disorient choreographing and dancing subjectivities from neoliberal meaning production. With chance operations, autobiography, and somatic practice, it aims to surrender choreographing from a decision-making subjectivity to the dancing and experiencing body and its affective-material entanglements. Choreographing can occur momentarily during dance improvisations and over more extended rehearsal periods. Regardless of the duration, choreographing is understood as the invisible unedited process that forms and orders dances. De-desiring challenges the choreographic process's product orientation, shown in the repetition and re-enactment of Western stage dance performances. It does so by applying ephemerality to the form of choreographic writing to unstuck the division between concrete labour's invisibility and abstract labour's representational visibility in dance making.

The application of ephemerality into choreographic writing is a response to Josefine Wikström's recognition that art's critique of capitalism must happen through the form of

the artwork. Regardless of being an ontological quality of dance, ephemerality is also an optical one. In my Post-Body Reflections "Lexicon" (2021), I argue that we see dance ephemerally disappearing as it appears. Its very existence occurs in a transitory state, leaving behind no tangible object to remember itself by, for us to sell, or to worship after its disappearance. Dance's fugitive emergence challenges common market values that revolve around goods, commodities, and products. The critical dance theorist André Lepecki finds that this is where the unique capacity of dance lies, to address the neoliberal rationality by creating alternative economies of objecthood. "Ephemerality is already dance's afterlife, the promise of an incalculable return without profit" (Lepecki, 2016: 16). Dance's fleetingness becomes its emergent value to question neoliberal reason centred on products. However, dance's ephemerality, treated as fleeting from the stage, fails to acknowledge other mechanisms of objecthood to which dance is subjected.

Dance performances that reproduce existing forms subject ephemerality to the visibility of objecthood. Ephemerality is often argued on the level of gesture that never repeats itself precisely. The performance studies professor Richard Schechner claims that postmodernist thinking sees performance as a response to a society of reproduction, that performance fails in the reproduction of identical commodities because two performances are never the same (Schechner et

al, 2020: 131). However, sameness shouldn't be argued on the level of gesture but the level of choreographic writing. That is because identical reproduction reasons how things are seen as the same but fails to recognize how they are written as the same. The choreographer Mette Ingvartsen asks, how badly do you really want to make a "good" performance if it means the end of reflection, searching, or finishing a performance into an object (Ingvartsen, 2011: 69)? To resist a performance as a finished product and to keep reflecting and searching, the research applies ephemerality into the form of choreographic writing.

With the group performance "Holy Motors", I worked towards a method of choreographing from within the dancing body, considering its entanglements in the group and between its environment. Instead of concerning itself with which scenes and movements will be displayed and in which order, it focussed on the performance space as a landscape of experience and knowledge production. We would, in fact, refer to our rehearsal sessions as meetings in "the space". By doing so, we acknowledged the agency of the performance environment, thus, referring to an ongoing questioning of what "the space" expects from us to enhance our investment in it. "The space" would consist of movement scores, theatre technology such as various sound and light equipment, and surfaces to write on and means to write with. "The space" would also consist of a dramaturgy that informs the purpose

of each element in relation to other elements. While the process of "Holy Motors" underlines an organization towards clarity, the clarity doesn't refer to form but to facilitation that informs "the space" and the performers' actions. "Holy Motors" in its various manifestations (with and without an audience) is both a performance and a process, indicating an ongoing investigation without a clear-cut end.

Ephemerality, here, refers to the live-sequencing and layering of various performance elements with chance, autobiography, and somatic practice while resisting the compositions to crystallize into a reproducible order. Next, I will look into each above mentioned operations that de-desiring is composed of by unfolding the dance performance "Holy Motors". The performance speculates a dancer's work environment where the dancers' labour is to find the body of dance. The body of dance is a speculative entity with an agency and a message that manifests when the dancers dance - differently for each dancer and each time. The dancers document and amplify dance's occurrence via text, video, and sound. Charcoal, a camera, and a microphone connected to a loop pedal assist in documenting dance, and tools such as an FM tuner and LED lights to amplify its occurrence. For documentation purposes, the stage is a paper installation where the durational open-score improvisation takes place. Dancers can freely move around and operate the equipment informed by their affective states within various ranges on the scale of desire/

desirelessness. The audience is invited to participate in the investigation by leaving traces on the paper and engaging in spontaneous interactions.

2.1 CHANCE OPERATIONS AND ARTICULATIONS OF DANCE

Chance is a choreographic method often associated with choreographer Merce Cunningham. During the 50s, Cunningham and composer John Cage began to research a performance-making method where the order of movements and scenes was decided by chance, such as by flipping the coin. In the process of "Holy Motors ", I began to develop an approach to chance choreography that, instead of relying on external media (such as the coin), is informed by improvisation. Siding chance with improvisation helped avoid chance becoming a technology of control but an operation of dancers' decision-making that is charged by not knowing what comes next and informed by actions, relations, and affects in the space. Improvisation is intended to keep the writing unreproducible. In contrast, Cunningham used chance as a technology of decision-making outside the human body and subjectivity. A coin flip would fix the order of the movements beforehand, and when Cunningham liked a specific composition, it would be re-performed (Nolan, 2020). My approach to chance underlies its relational and coincidental aspects - that one body's actions in space inform another. Relationality withholds an affective triggering that

will be the subject of further attention and undoing in the following chapters (chapters 2.2. and 2.3).

I am referring to chance operations led by improvisation because of a pre-existing vocabulary (the making of such vocabulary is addressed in chapter 2.2) that is similar to Cunningham's approach, where he used the chance to sequence his movement vocabulary. The "Holy Motors" vocabulary consisted of various movement scores (see appendix 2), recorded soundscapes, an FM radio, a LED light, a microphone and a looper paddle, a video camera, written texts (see appendix 3), and instruments (charcoal, laptop) to write with. While each element had a purpose to either document and/or amplify the manifestation of the body of dance, the order of engaging with them and layering them between one another was decided by dancers' affective entanglements. The pre-existing vocabulary refers to the singularity of each vocabulary unit that, through the operations of layering and sequencing, come together into an assemblage. Deleuze speaks of assemblages as articulations composed by power and holding power (Wise, 2011). Here, the aspect of power is understood as whether these assemblages confirm an expectation of what dance should consist of in society or fracture such an expectation.

By opening the articulation process to chance, chance operations aim to subvert dominant articulation systems

and, by that, the meanings of dance in society . In "Holy Motors", improvisation allows articulations to appear and disappear. The dropping and picking up of new actions underline operations of cutting, editing, and various modes of layering, unfolding the manifestation of a plurality of articulations, non-crystallized yet changing and becoming. This subverts a mode of re-articulating a pre-conceived knowability, characteristic of representational thinking (dance languaging), to an articulation informed by affective bodily entanglements (dance thinking). Chance operations led by improvisation allow the articulations of dance to keep unfolding—the unfolding hints alterity, an unknowability that instigates movement. Therefore, chance operations in "Holy Motors" allow renegotiating mobility not as a response to abstract nor concrete labour but as a response to not knowing . Dismantling the Marxian concrete and abstract labour binary also allows for collapsing process-product binaries and a beginning of speculating dancers' labour value in relation to the motility of not-knowing.

The not-knowing in "Holy Motors" is three-fold. Firstly, not-knowing what dance is, secondly, not-knowing what is about to happen in space, and thirdly, the durational setting enhanced the deep unsettling unknowability even more. Tim Etchells, performer of Forced Entertainment, says that within a durational performance, there is a saturation point where the performers' defences drop. They get tired and lose control

over their best behaviour on the stage. Duration, tiredness, and improvisation allow performers to reach intuitions that were previously unavailable (ForcedEntertainment, 2014). In "Holy Motors", the tiredness enhanced the sensation of not knowing because it accessed intuitions from one's deep rooting into the conditions of their body, exhausted from expectations and societal inscriptions. We accessed textures such as speeds, densities, losing, and finding the desire to dance. The unscriptedness and duration allowed each dancer's relationship (on the scale of desire and desirelessness) to the body of dance to guide their journey in the space.

Outlining each dancer's desire to find the body of dance reveals an affective relationship between the dancer and the dance. Affect is a psychosomatic state that makes a relationship felt. Critical feminist theorist Sara Ahmed's affective theory draws attention to the apartness of the subject and object of desire, in which the object of desire evokes "good" feelings in the subject and becomes something to possess (Ahmed, 2010: 34). That resonates with the Deleuzian understanding of capitalism inscribing lacks and needs in its subjects that subjugate one to fulfil these needs (Holland, 2005: 54). While Ahmed notes a directionality of affect, from a desiring subject towards the desired object, the present research suggests disorienting the coordinates between the subject and object of desire by staying with affect as an embodied

sensation. The next chapter, 2.2, discusses the disorienting of coordinates between the dancer and the dance to invest in dancing as an encounter with alterity. Chapter 2.3 discusses disorienting coordinates between the dancer, other dancers and their environment to begin imagining disorienting the coordinates between the dancer and the audience.

Working with chance operations unfolds de-desiring from several perspectives. Firstly, chance operations disorient the logic of choreographic writing that re-articulates, repeats and re-enacts. Instead, chance operations bring choreographic writing within the dancing body and its relations in the performance space. Whilst Cunningham used chance operations as a technology for choreographing outside of the human subjectivity, my work with chance aims to reach beyond one's cognitive decision-making to bodily sense-making patterns (further discussed in chapter 2.3). That is to renegotiate the value of dancers' labour with articulations informed by their affective bodily entanglements (dance thinking). Furthermore, chance enhances not knowing as a physical sensation of unrest and a motor for movement. By doing so, chance challenges the Marxian concrete and abstract labour binary and helps to speculate the motility of not-knowing as one that signifies dancers' labour. Furthermore, chance in a durational setting brings dancers in contact with impulses that evidence each dancer's relationship to finding the body of dance. The following subchapter will explore the

affective liminal space between the dancer and the dance.

2.2 AUTOBIOGRAPHY AND THE AFFECTIVE LIMINALITY

Alongside four other dancers, I worked in the making of the dance performance "Holy Motors ". The group consisted of movers with different backgrounds, such as yoga, acting, physical theatre, and dance. The choice to mix professional and non-professional dancers came from a wish to disjoint dance from its connotation with virtuosity and to implant thinking of dancing from the perspective of each dancer's relationship to it. The operation of autobiography invited the group to think of a dance we had danced in the past. Dancing, where we experienced an uncontrollable affective state in which the only immediate remedy was to act on the impulse to rhythmically move our bodies. By doing so, I attempted to outline familiar components of how dancing in a neoliberal capitalist society manifest. In other words, to collect data about what we so far know about the conditions that a dance emerges from. These components composed the vocabulary that chance operations and somatic practice with fascia re-arranged into various ephemeral assemblages.

The instruction to think of a dance led by an uncontrollable impulse to rhythmically move our bodies refers to instances of choreomania (the dancing plague) in European medieval history. Choreomania has been documented to take place with several thousand people being taken over by an uncontrollable impulse to epileptically move their bodies in public spaces, usually in town squares. The dancers have been reported to be unconscious or in a state of trance. These instances have been reported to occur during hardships such as hunger and poverty, and contemporary historians speculate whether these conditions brought the human bodies to react to the oppressive life of colonial feudal states (Gotman, 2018). Choreographer Anne Mareike Hess's "Tanzwut" (2014) is triggered by the choreomaniac interpretation of dance as liberation and ecstasy and by bridging historic dancing plagues with contemporary clubbing culture, she explores the role of dance in today's society. By doing so, she introduces the approach to dance being a symptom of a system of oppression - an excess of energy that is not external to a regime but a result of it and by oozing through its structural tenets, it holds the potential to transgress the very system that leaks it.

To inspect such a state of dancing, I asked the group to choose a memory of an uncontrollable need to dance. We wrote detailed descriptions (see appendix 3) considering the imaginations, sensations, and thoughts we experienced and the environment in which we danced. The texts exposed that dancing, one way or another, included moving our human body, was accompanied and/or triggered by a song and was an act of releasing (some sort of) tension. These components became part of the performance vocabulary. We recorded the

songs and revisited the dances by dancing them. Over time the source material of the past dances deformed into various sound, movement, and text-related scores (see appendix 2). This deformation defaces Western choreographic traditions fixated on re-enactment by exposing the impossibility of reproducing a past dance. Defacement is propelled by Michael Taussig's analysis that when sacred objects such as money or nations flag in secular societies become routinized and social, they lose their symbolic power (Taussig, 1999: 1). While the desire to re-live a past dance was central to the "Holy Motors" dramaturgy, it lost its authority with its incapacity. Instead, the failure began stretching the distance between the desiring subject (the dancer) and the desired object (re-living a past dance) and allowed disorienting the coordinates between them.

Further disorientation was reached with chance operations beginning to disjoint the autobiographic performance vocabulary from its familiar articulations into unfamiliar ones by constructing fractured assemblages. The crookedness of the unfit fittings would open affective spaces where meanings of dance could be renegotiated. That is because slight unfamiliarity causes feelings of dissatisfaction, disorientation, and imbalance. It refers to what it reminds of - the idea of what dancing should be like but fails to present it as such. Transdisciplinary artist and philosopher Erin Manning, with the concept of the infrathin, addresses that quality of the

in-between, an interval that cannot quite be articulated but is nonetheless felt. Infrathin underlines the existence of a quality that cannot be reduced to the sum of the parts it manifests within. It is a space with a relational agency that escapes definitions because to define it would be to give it the form that eludes it (Manning, 2020: 19). The concept of infrathin helps to look at dancing as being in contact with that felt, inarticulable in-betweenness and to begin imagining the body of dance as an excessive excretion from the dark liminalities of the linguistic order. The dancers in "Holy Motors" engage with that liminality by investing in finding the body of dance - a task with a goal but without an end result that stretches the affective space between the dance and the dancer.

Choreographer Alice Chauchat introduces dancing as a relationship between the dancer and the dance. That dancing is an encounter with alterity that invites us to dedicate ourselves to acknowledge otherness without trying to estimate or measure it, to engage in something unqualified that will always exceed whatever we know of it (Chauchat, 2017: 32). Chauchat inspires the present research to further imagine dancing as a landscape between the dancer and the dance, to re-think dancing from the perspective of the world it unfolds. It reveals subjective entanglements such as one's relationship and reasons to dance, imaginations, frustrations, and affects encountered, but it also connects the

dancer with myofascial tone (fascia and muscle modulating movement) and gravity. The dance practitioner Kerstin Kussmaul says that because gravity is a non-human agent, the myofascial modulation of gravity finds the non-human in us. Furthermore, the myofascial tone, with its numerous free nerve endings, connects us to our surrounding and the other within it (Kussmaul, 2021). Therefore, dancing connects the dancer with the human, non-human, and the other within them, evoking the emergence of the more-than-human, (Abram, 2012) – an inclusive awareness beyond the individual subject's centrality in their world-making. A rhizomatic, more-than-human awareness challenges the faciality of the neoliberal signification and subjectivation processes and instead nurtures both processes on multiple open-ended trajectories.

Dancing unfolds a landscape of becoming that invites investment in. It is a landscape of both the human, non-human, and other, similar to the Deleuzian concept of the Body without Organs (BwO). The BwO is the "locus of coding, where social representations capture desire and assign it determinate goals, but (…) also the locus of de-coding, where desire exceeds or subverts any and all socially imposed representations" (Holland, 2005: 58). Dancing, as the BwO, is a landscape where the both/and - the human, non-human, and other diffract (Barad, 2018) into an interference that exceeds the sum of all parts, that signifies

the beginning of imagining beyond what is known. Here my approach differs from Rainer's, whose stance is combative in a contrarian way. However, de-desiring does not oppose dance languaging. De-desiring relies on the understanding that opposition thinks within the system's frame and confirms the system's power. De-desiring, using deconstruction takes dance languaging apart to propose alternative, ephemeral articulations that open affective spaces, where it is possible to diffract, imagine, and speculate patterns of world-making, alternative to the neoliberal capitalist one.

Autobiography gives de-desiring a goal (re-living a past dance), enabling it to become goalless, deviate, and keep reflecting and searching. The aspect of the goal and goallessness challenges the process-product binary by opening a space in-between that makes possible diffraction and encountering more than we know. Chauchat (2017: 41) addresses the conflict between the goal and goallessness by saying that dancers need to accept that they do not quite know, but on the other hand, they must believe that there is something to understand. The space between the dancer and dance challenges the social meanings of dance from within the landscape of one's personal, indeterminate desire to dance. In that landscape, the dancer encounters the human, non-human, and the other within, enabling connection to the other in the environment.

2.3 FASCIA AND MUTATING ENCOUNTERS

Fascia refers to movement research within somatic practices to practice staying with an affect as a psychosomatic bodily quality. Fascia is the connective tissue, a structure that casts a thin web that surrounds the organs, blood vessels, muscles, and bones and holds them in place. Fascia is important in reducing muscle friction and supporting nerves and blood vessels as they move through and in-between the muscles. Fascia and muscle (the myofascial tone) both modulate movement; however, in the somatic practices, there is an understanding that while the muscle is moved by the self, the fascia connects us to the other. Dance practitioner Kerstin Kussmaul (2021) refers to fascia as a sensorium "that connects us to our surroundings by haptic sensation composed by tactile and weight-related input". The numerous free nerve endings in the fascia lead to the anterior insular cortex, which is thought to be linked to self-recognition, awareness of the environment, and the integration of feelings related to the body (ibid, 2021). Within this research, fascia was explored to access dance thinking from within the deep tissues of the body's materiality, with which chance operations and autobiography was applied to choreographic writing.

The group activated the fascia with the exercises of bouncing and cellular breathing. Cellular breathing is a meditation from the Body Mind Centering, a somatic practice developed by the researcher, educator, and movement artist Bonnie

Bainbridge Cohen. Through breath and visualisation, cellular breathing invites one to imagine each body cell breathing individually. Bouncing shakes and softens the myofascial tone in reaction to gravity. Both exercises were practised between 20-40 minutes that activated the fascia to a tingly sensation that covered the body in a softly charged coat. By asking the cognitive choice-making self to remain as a listener, the coat began to move the body. Listening, here, refers to a dancer's undivided attention toward kinetic and somatic bodily processes. When ideas of communication often see the speaker as active and the listener as passive, the research's somatic work with fascia understands that listening actively contributes to the space it inhabits. Whilst linguist Mikhail Bakhtin says speakers act as possible worlds (Bakhtin in Kanngieser, 2014: 237), I propose that listening lets another world in; it evokes ambivalences, otherness, and questions of boundaries.

Bakhtin offers a way of thinking about the processes of subjectivation. For Bakhtin, rather than being originally called into being as linguistic or psychological subjects, world-making happens through speaking (ibid, 2014: 237). In contrast, the present research invites to recognise how listening equally participates in the world-making from the perspective of inviting gentle disorientations within one's established perceptions about the world and their subjectivity within it. Moving from the fascia underlines a negotiation

of speaking and listening within a dancer's body, between cognitive and physical processes. It is a dialogic practise that alters both - the knowing self and the living body into a diffraction, what Deleuze calls the "larval subject" (Posteraro, 2015). That refers to the organism as an embodied subject in the process of unfolding in its own temporal field. The formation of the organism as a subject within this research happens in relation to affect. Affects are approached as embodied processes that call for action and reaction. Cohen says about embodiment:

> *"Embodiment is the cell's awareness of themselves. You let go of your conscious mapping. It is a direct experience, there are no intermediary steps or translations. There is no guide, no witness. In this instance, the brain is the last to know" (Cohen, 1993: 158).*

Cohen underlines the primacy of sensations in the body because due to the transmission and translation of nerve impulses, the cognitive subject is the last to be informed. The sensation is registered before it is given a meaning. Somatic work with the fascia unfolds de-desiring as stretching the space between the affect and giving it a meaning. Deleuze says that being within the desire, a void of and/or a desert of desire, is where desire becomes indeterminate and the coordinates of object and subject become lost (Boundas 1997: 113). It becomes possible to attune to other bodies from within that stretched space of desire. Kaussman's research shows that fascial life creates a social web, a sense of "we" within and between bodies and the environment. Moreover, she notices

how fascia becomes activated in response to relationality as fascia is nourished only by people's physical presence (Kaussman, 2021). Concerning the somatic practice in the "Holy Motors" process, the wish to engage with one another became evident as we recognised a desire to be in contact, touch, and play. However, staying with the affect allowed us to distance ourselves from our initial impulses, suggesting that the first impulses were informed by the lacks and needs inscribed by neoliberal determination of desire. Staying with bodily sensorial processes, initiated encounters mediated by listening: we measured the energy and investment within one's body and calculated the other body's readiness to receive that impulse, introducing care, attunement and attending to another.

Improvisation is loaded with impulses that mutate within the confluence of interactions. Sometimes impulses mutated before they were acted upon because the circulation of information and actions within the space triggered other impulses. However, when the impulses were acted upon, the encounter exceeded the interacting parties' expectations. The mutations underline the aspect of alteration that in "Holy Motors" exposed our pre-established expectations toward an encounter and the encountered. Embodiment asked us to let go of expectations and allow the encounter to unfold our subjectivities within it, revealing the intra-action present. Intra-action is a concept from the queer and quantum

theorist Karen Barad (2007), who differentiates intra-actions from interactions with interactions occurring between pre-established subjects and objects, while intra-actions refer to the forming of subjectivities within their entanglements. By making the relationality felt within the body's deep tissues, fascia connects the body to other bodies in space and, by doing so, nurtures awareness about the altering and becoming relationality between bodies, meanings, and subjectivities.

De-desiring is an embodied choreographic practice that writes from within one's affective entanglements. Within neoliberal capitalism, affect is traditionally considered a feeling toward something, and somebody, withholding subjugating and ordering properties. However, stretching the space between the affect and its meaning allowed to begin losing the coordinates between the subject and object of desire. Dancing unfolded as a dialogic landscape between the human, non-human and the other within, desiring to encounter the other in the environment. In "Holy Motors", the encounters began mutating our desires from what we thought we desired toward new pathways of desiring to listen, care, and attend to - modes of being with, as opposed to controlling. That is the emergence of dance thinking, an affective, embodied, and relational meaning-making to unstuck desire captured by neoliberal social representations. Next, I will investigate how dance thinking communicates by reflecting on the dance performance "Holy Motors" audience hospitality.

3. DANCE THINKING

Dance thinking is a term borrowed from the choreographer Eleanor Bauer who distinguishes between dance thought and language thought. Bauer claims that thinking always happens within a medium that structures the world around us (Bauer, 2018: 147). Working with different forms of translation, transposition, and intermediation, Bauer asks how dance thinks, how it writes, and how a (re)configured relationship between dancing and writing informs a choreographic practice (Bauer, 2022). In contrast to Bauer's, the present research situates the terms thinking and languaging in a constellation that claims that dance thinking in the neoliberal market is read through the filter of language. This language is the dominating medium through which dance thinking is subjugated to its premises, thus becoming dance languaging. The present research, too, seeks choreographic writing informed by dance thinking. However, it does so by de-desiring as it situates affect theory as its lens to undo desire captured by dance languaging. De-desiring is a choreographic practice that aims to disorient the determination of desire informed by neoliberal abstract labour standards and for desire to manifest on many open-ended trajectories. De-desiring occurs within the affective relationships between the dancer, her dance, other dancers, and the audience. This chapter unfolds how dance thinking as a mode of choreographic writing communicates by

discussing the dance performance "Holy Motors" hospitality toward the audience.

Communication happens with and between bodies - abstract labour as a social form informs and mediates inter- and intra-actions within a society; it standardizes demands and needs that one should be expected to be measured against. These expectations do not rule only the labour market but percolate to all aspects of social fabric like familiar, personal, and educational relationships. Subjectivities are formed within these encounters as much as the subjects make the encounters. Neoliberal ideology is enforced by language but enacted by bodies. My research seeks dance thinking to mediate alternative intra-actions to those mediated by abstract labour and potentially to renegotiate the concept of labour from within that relational field. The relevance of "Holy Motors" working in a group setting was to practice undoing interactions led by capitalist desires and nurture modes of intra-acting where one's self-preservation and -awareness expands to awareness and preservation of the space and other bodies within it. The practices of de-desiring, the somatic work with fascia, autobiography, and chance operations facilitated an environment of listening - a staying in contact with the other and with the otherness within.

The listening in a durational open score setting allows further engagement with the poetics of labour as it shifts a dancer's awareness from a goal to the (a)live interactions surrounding her. The choreographer Paz Rojo says about the use of scores in her PhD performance "Eclipse Mundo" (2018), "it should not happen what we believe must happen" (Rojo, 2019). By saying that, she evidences the necessity of the planned in relation to the unplanned. Furthermore, she marks a shift from the dancers being at the service of a score toward the tools and strategies serving them. While "Holy Motors" worked with scores (see appendix 2), the score was a suggestion, not a rule. An open approach to the score challenges labour on a process-product binary concerning its goal, profitability, and efficiency. It does not promote being goalless but uses goal to open an in-between space where a work toward something could deviate, deform, and become more than one expects from it while being aware of the encounters one's labour manifests in.

Abstract labour as a social form commodifies its subjects by measuring one against their labour performance. It reinforces being in a state of continuous movement, agitation, and performance that leaves a mark on subjects' physical and mental health. The research claims that the relational awareness of dance practice can challenge intra-actions mediated by abstract labour, but the dancers' performance of virtuosity on Western dance stages further affirms neoliberal evaluation criteria. "Holy Motors" seeks meaning to dancers' labour beyond its representational value but acknowledges

the challenge of overturning the authority of the gaze. Within the Western culture, the vision is considered a first-hand contact with the real that seduces the visual representational field to be connoted with truth (Phelan, 1994: 13). Ocular centrism empowers dance languaging as the gaze measures dancers' bodies against social representations, failing to see the embodied knowledge within. The art historian John Berger evidences the conflict between the predicaments of the gaze in recognizing another's internal intentions with the example of nude and naked bodies in painting.

"To be naked is to be oneself; to be nude is to be seen naked by others and yet not recognized for oneself. A nude has to be seen as an object in order to be a nude" (Everything…, 2018).

With that, Berger underlines the aspect of representational thinking, where meaning is something formed in the mind beforehand of one's encounters that then measures encountered bodies against these pre-conceived ideas. The conflict illustrated by the nude and the naked is present in "Holy Motors" regarding whether the dancers are seen as representations instead of recognized for the embodied, relational knowledge within. Berger underlines a necessary negotiation of agency and responsibility between how one invites themselves to be valued and whether that invitation is recognized and accepted. "Holy Motors" program notes invited the audience into a speculative deconstruction site where the dancers were tasked to find the body of dance to

question the meanings dance has in society. This mode of welcoming in itself entails an invitation for an audience to de-desire any pre-conceived expectations about what they think dance is. I avoided claiming the workspace as a site of renegotiating the value of dancers' labour (de-desiring) to resist repeating patterns of representational thinking where an idea about an encounter is formed before it happens. I wished the invitation to de-desire to oscillate from the choreographic writing in dance thinking instead of verbally pronouncing it beforehand.

3.1 THE WITNESS AND THE WITH-NESS

The concept of the infrathin unfolded dance's inarticulability within the capitalist language of production and reproduction. Infrathin refers to quality within a linguistic system that is felt and cannot be defined because to give it form would be to elude its relational agency. The infrathin illustrates a relational in-between space from which dance thinking emerges as an inkling that bodies recognize before defining them. The research investigated these embodied inklings through affect theory. All communication is affective, also that between the dancer and her dance. Because of its psychosomatic disposition, affect makes the relationship felt, yet the dancer may not quite articulate with whom she's in a relationship. The performance "Holy Motors", with the choreographic writing in dance thinking, wished to extend the relationship and the de-desiring within to the audience, so that meanings

of dance and dancers' labour value could be renegotiated. "Holy Motors" wished to affect the audience with motility of unrest to find the body of dance. Being affected refers to shifting from a witnessing audience to a with-nessing (Manning, 2019) one. While the witness sees the body before them and remains distanced from it, the with-ness becomes entangled with the one they are seeing. With-nessing entails an aspect of listening, a being in contact with the one seen that lets their world in.

At the door, the invigilator gave the audience context about the dancers' work environment they were about to enter - about the dancers working on finding the body of dance. The announcement aimed to initiate recognition of the value of dancers' labour relating to the alterity of meanings dance has. She further informed that the dancers were working on encountering the body of dance by re-living a past dance. She then handed each audience member a non-reoccurring page from an "A report of a past dance". The reports were composed of text from reflective writings from the process. They enacted as metaphorical windows inside the dancers' bodies and as invitations to participate. The reports, each page unique, signified how dance is perceived in the space – becoming, transforming, un-repeatable. The invigilator invited the audience to assist the dancers in their investigation. Like the dancers were engaged in various forms of writing and dancing, the audience was invited to edit the report they were given and leave text on the paper installation.

The invitation to participate supported the invitation to engage with the motility of unrest to find the body of dance. Accepting the motility of unrest entailed de-desiring any pre-conceived expectations about what dance is. It entailed a willingness to question and encounter its alterity of meanings. The invitation to de-desire oscillated from the choreographic writing, from the intertwining of chance operations, autobiography, and somatic work. Chance operations led by improvisation invited choreographic writing that began organizing and transforming the vocabulary around what is known about dancing into assemblages informed by the dancers' affects. These assemblages, while consisting of familiar elements, would compose unfamiliar articulations. The practice with the group showed that deviating from "known" presentations of dancing induces a tingling sensation of unrest in the viewer. That is because it refers to what it reminds of - the idea of what dancing should be like but fails to present it as such. The deviation from the expected would open affective spaces where one's re-assessment of the familiar and the unfamiliar challenges established expectations for dancers and where the unfolding of the alterity of meanings invite modes of being with, with-nessing.

Some of the exchanges I had with audience members after the performance revealed that they were affected by a

desire to understand the logic of "the space" that guided the investigation. Rather than the dancers' moving bodies as objects of desire, the audience members were curious to make sense of what informed the dancers' choice-making and to engage with the traces left in the space. Additionally, my reflection from a performer's position recognized a readiness in the audience to engage with the work, the group, and the space. I noted spontaneous encounters mediated by materials, writing and eye contact. Some encounters were shorter; some unfolded over a longer duration, such as when a dancer and an audience member pieced together a mathematical formula about the body of dance that only the two could understand. There were also instances when audience members encountered one another in writing. These are some examples of when an intimate language developed beyond the performing dancers' bodies. The developed language marks the emergence of a shared space, not oriented to finding the truth as logocentricity is, according to Derrida (1997), but one oriented to attending to one another. The emergence of a shared space signifies the extension of the affective relationality and the de-desiring to the audience.

While the performance space welcomed the audience to participate, the evaluation criteria for an audience member to be impacted by the motility of unrest didn't necessarily expect participation by actively moving. First and foremost,

being impacted by the motility of unrest meant welcoming a desire to encounter the body of dance. The research understands finding the body of dance as a task against which the value of dancers' labour is renegotiated. It is a task with a goal, but without an end result that enhances awareness of one's spatial entanglements. Therefore, an audience member being impacted by the wish to encounter the body of dance signifies their readiness to renegotiate the value of dancers' labour in relation to dance's unfolding meanings. An audience member revealed that they were engaged regardless of not moving and/or writing. Instead, they used the dancers as reference points to understand the affective and embodied sense-making guiding the investigation. That reveals the shift from a witnessing audience to a with-nessing one.

There were also contrasting reflections where an audience member admitted to being tired and therefore not feeling so comfortable in a tight and dense studio space. However, the choice of not making it too accommodating to the audience by not providing seats and having the air thick of warmth and sweat due to the "work-day" being in motion hours before the audience entered was to stay true to unglamourized aspects of the studio practice. It outlined the dancers' labour as what the audience was invited to intra-act with. The radical truthfulness to a dancer's work environment motivated the audience to find their agency within that space – whether by accepting the invitation to engage with the body of dance in

its many variations and outcomes or by resisting the space. Resistance, too, is an affective mode of relating that can contrast one's positions within the proposed environment.

The confrontationality of the performance space was triggered by a wish to encounter the dynamics that begin to form and reconfigure the "dancers" and "audience" inter- and intra-actions in the space. It was a gesture to invite subjectivities to be formed in relation to the body of dance. It reinforced dancers' agency to renegotiate their labour value from the abstract labour standards to their awareness of the (a)live entanglements their labour manifests in. Furthermore, to the unique, intimate language that develops between intra-acting subjectivities - a language that does not seek truth in definitions but to be in contact. While de-desiring in "Holy Motors" succeeded in fostering a shift from a witnessing toward a with-nessing audience, the researcher sees further potential to disorient the roles of the "audience" and "dancer" in the space. For example, instigating movement between the edges and the centre of the space would further disorient and diffract the identities of "dancer" and "audience". A bigger performance environment and a longer duration open to the audience throughout all its length would possibly make such movement possible.

CONCLUSION

Finding the body of dance was a task to speculate on dancers' relationship with dance to begin undoing abstract labour as the mediating form of neoliberal capitalism. Abstract labour forms subjectivities and informs their interactions within neoliberal capitalism. It is a hierarchizing and violent social form that, by reinforcing ideals of virtuosity, efficiency, and multitasking, leaves marks on bodies and mental health. The research claimed that dance thinking - a language that, instead of subjugating another to preconceived definitions, criteria, and standards, attends to them - can mediate alternative interactions to those mediated by abstract labour. However, dancers' virtuous performance on the stage (dance languaging) enacts as a neoliberal social representation that, by instrumentalizing its citizen's desire, affirms abstract labour as a social form. The choreographic method of de-desiring aimed to unstuck desire determined by dance languaging, to seek the emergence of dance thinking.

De-desiring allows the relational field between the dancer and the dance agency to signify themselves, thus keeping their signification and subjectivation becoming on open-ended trajectories. The research and the dance performance "Holy Motors" revealed that the unfolding of the relationship between the dancer and dance in its continuous changing,

dropping, and transforming of meanings can challenge the singularity of the neoliberal paradigm and possibly offer a beginning of imagining alternative (market) relations. Renegotiating a dancer's labour value from the goal of being a "good" dancer to its affective embodied entanglements can challenge the process-product binary of labour as we know it. The research sees further potential to engage with the poetics of labour by beginning to re-think labour from within and between working bodies, as opposed to its connotation to profit, efficiency, and product.

The choreographic method of de-desiring with chance operations, autobiography, and somatic practice revealed desired results in evidencing the affective, relational field between bodies and its capacity to invite a shift from a witnessing audience to a with-nessing one. However, the research sees further potential in disorienting subject formation within the roles of "choreographer", "dancer", and "audience". Attention to spatial and participatory factors that make the "audience" and "dancers" could foster an audience beginning to think of themselves as dancers. By doing so, the concept of dance, its potential, and urgency can be further renegotiated from within each unique body that encounters it through dancing.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abram, D. (2012) The spell of the sensuous: Perception and language in a more-than-human world. New York: Vintage Books.

Ahmed, S. (2010) Happy objects. In: M. Gregg, G.J. Seigworth, and S. Ahmed (eds.), The affect theory reader. North Carolina: Duke University Press, pp. 29-51.

Bauer, E. (2018) Effing the ineffable. In: M. Spångberg (ed.), Movement Research. Stockholm: MDT, pp. 147-188.

Barad, K. (2018) Diffracting diffraction: Cutting together-apart. In B. M. Kaiser, K. Thiele (eds.) Diffracted Worlds – Diffractive Readings. London and New York: Routledge, pp. 4–23.

Barad, K. (2007) Meeting the universe halfway: Quantum physics and the entanglement of matter and meaning. North Caroline: Duke University Press.

Bishop, C. (2018) Black box, white cube, gray zone: Dance exhibitions and audience attention. TDR/The Drama Review, 62(2), pp. 22-42.

Boundas, C. V. (1997) The Deleuze Reader. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.

Brandstetter, G. (2011) Transcription – Materiality – Signature. Dancing and writing between resistance and excess. In: Klein, G. and Noeth, S. (eds.) Emerging Bodies. Bielefeld: transcript-Verlag, pp. 119-136

Chauchat, A. (2018) Not-knowing: Mobility as a state of unrest. In M. Spångberg (ed.), Movement Research, Stockholm: MDT, pp. 288-308.

Chauchat, A. (2017) Generative fictions, or how dance may teach us ethics. In M. Edvardsen, M. Spångberg, and D. Andersson (eds.), Post Dance, Stockholm: MDT, pp. 29-43.

Cohen, B. B. (1993) Sensing Feeling and Action. Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books.

Deleuze, G. and Guattari, F. (1987) A thousand plateaus: Capitalism and schizophrenia. 2nd ed. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

D'Errico, L. (2019) For a future of the face: Faciality and performance in the dance of Marlene Monteiro Freitas. In P. de Assis, and P. Giudici, (eds.), Aberrant nuptials: Deleuze and artistic research, Belgium: Leuven University Press, pp. 357-370.

Derrida, J. (1997) Of grammatology. Translated by G. C. Spivak. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Everything has its first time (2018) John Berger "nudity" in ways of seeing, episode 2 1972. Youtube. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NyQ-gCTyYvQ (Accessed: June 19, 2022).

ForcedEntertainment (2014) Tim Etchells on Durational Performance. Youtube. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7mLlozWPbVs (Accessed: June 19, 2022).

Gotman, K. (2018) Choreomania: Dance and Disorder. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Hess, A. M. (2014) Tanzwut. Available at: https://www.annemareikehess.com/works/Tanzwut.html (Accessed June 23, 2022).

Holland, E. W. (2005) Desire. In: Stivale (ed.) Gilles Deleuze: Key Concepts. Montréal, QC, Canada: McGill-Queen's University Press, pp. 53-62.

Ingvartsen, M. (2011) Experimental practices. In M. Ingvartsen (ed.) every-body's publications: 6 Months in 1 Location, pp. 69-72.

Kanngieser, A. (2014) Towards a careful listening. In: P. Plotegher, M. Zechner, and B. R. Hansen (eds.), Nanopolitics Handbook. Brooklyn, NY: Minor Compositions.

Kunst, B. (2017) Some thoughts on the labour of the dancer. In: M. Edvardsen, M. Spångberg, and D. Andersson (eds.), Post Dance, Stockholm: MDT, pp. 116-134.

Kunst, B. (2011) Dance and work: The aesthetic and political potential of dance. In Klein, G. and Noeth, S. (eds.) Emerging Bodies. Bielefeld: transcript-Verlag, pp. 47–60.

Kussmaul, K. (2021) The Matter of Fascia: Ecological thinking through embodied practice. Performance of the Real Journal. Available at: https://performancereal.pubpub.org/pub/fpqv1egk/release/3 (Accessed: June 19, 2022).

Lepecki, A. (2006) Exhausting dance: Performance and the politics of movement. London, England: Routledge.

Lepecki, A. (2016) Singularities: Dance in the age of performance. London and New York: Routledge.

Manning, E. (2020) For a pragmatics of the useless. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Manning, E. (2019) Toward a politics of immediation. Frontiers in sociology. Available at: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fsoc.2018.00042/full (Accessed: June 19, 2022).

Noland, C. (2020) Merce Cunningham: After the arbitrary. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Phelan, P., (1994). Unmarked: The Politics of Performance. London: Routlege.

Posteraro, T. S. (2015) Deleuze's larval subject. Symposium: Canadian Journal of Continental Philosophy. Available at: https://www.academia.edu/40309826/Deleuzes_Larval_Subject (Accessed: June 19, 2022).

Rainer, Y. (2013) No Manifesto. Available at: https://www.ktufsd.org/cms/lib/NY19000262/Centricity/Domain/116/No%20Manifesto.pdf (Accessed: June 23, 2022).

Rojo, P. (2019) The decline of choreography and its movement: a body's (path)way. Stockholm University of the Arts (SKH), (3). Available at: https://www.researchcatalogue.net/view/727172/727173 (Accessed: June 19, 2022).

Schechner, R. and Lucie, S. (2020) Performance studies: An introduction, London and New York: Routledge.

Sirel, K. (2020). Dancing on top of a hill (video performance). Module: Designing the Body of Research. Unpublished.

Sirel, K. (2020). Disciplinary Images (reflective journal). Module: Designing the Body of Research Unpublished.

Sirel, K. (2021). Lexicon (lexicon). Module: Post-Body Reflections. Unpublished.

Sirel, K. (2022). De-desiring dance language (interactive blog). Module: Schizo-Somatics. Available at: https://kastan13.wixsite.com/de-desiringdl (Accessed June 23, 2022).

Taussig, M. (1999) Defacement: Public secrecy and the labor of the negative. Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press.

Wikström, J. (2019) A critique of capitalism? Parsejournal.com. Available at: https://parsejournal.com/article/a-critique-of-capitalism-the-mediation-of-abstract-labour-in-yvonne-rainers-task-dance/ (Accessed: June 19, 2022).

Wise, J. M. (2011) Assemblage. In: Stivale (ed.) Gilles Deleuze: Key Concepts. Montréal, QC, Canada: McGill-Queen's University Press, pp. 77-86.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1
Link to video : https://vimeo.com/735225454/2c2749443b

APPENDIX 2
SCORES, UNSEQUENCED
invite to be split, combined, and layered between one another.

Think about a dance you danced in the past. A dance that emerged from an uncontrollable need to rhythmically move your body.

Write a detailed description about that dance, concerning the imaginations, sensations, physical qualities that you experienced.

In case the dance was accompanied by a song, play it.

Re-live the past dance by dancing it.

Can you recognize a friction between desire and inability?

Write another desription based on your current experience. Compare the texts.

Imagine a smaller version of yourself dancing your past dance within your body.

Begin speculating the body of your dance - how it carries your body, where does it take you, what does it want from

you, how does it interact?

How does it touch another?

Record a reading of „A report of a past dance" into a looper paddle.

Layer several readings.
Play the recording back on loop.

Write what you hear on the paper installation.

Write until you are exhausted.

Did you find yourelf dancing?

Lay with your back on the floor.

Breath in and out.

Imagine a tunnel from your belly button through which the breath enters and exits your body.

Imagine all the cells in your body beginning to breath through their center.

Observe your body beginning to move.

Allow your moving body to encounter words on the paper installation.

Allow the words to translate to your body and transform your movement.

Choose a word that you repeat out loud until it becomes a sound and looes its meaning.

Hear it transform.

Allow the sound to enter your body and to move it.

Find repetition and transformation, both in the body and voice.

Find an engine within your body.

Connect with a pendulum-like movement and its repetitive power.

Attune to fascia.

Observe the repetition transforming.

Listen, allow the transformation to guide the body as opposed to the body guiding the transformation.

Open yourself to the space. Is someone encountering the body of dance?

Turn off the work-lights and turn on the LED.

Direct the spotlight toward the body of dance.

Find a song from the FM radio to amplify the occurrence of dance.

Document the dance by writing, recording, or filming.

Turn the work-lights back on and LED off after you are finished to document.

APPENDIX 3

EXAMPLE OF REFLECTIVE WRITING

An excerpt from a body of text puzzled together from the reflective writings. Each one's text trasforming, ovelapping, continuing to another's. This text composed „A report of a past dance" handed to the audience, each page with non-reocurring writing. The text was also applied to the score, read and layered into the loop pedal.

… am I in the room or not? I am on my sofa and I feel my sofa touching me. Occasionally I walk to this other place, that is like a memory but not. It is a spaceless space where things and thoughts get stuck, where they remain centuries unfound. I am there as much as I am here. There is a burning itch. I can't reach it though. It leads but it pushes. Pushes forward. It does not give the shoulder, the neck, the elbow a break. Neither the hand nor the lower back. It leads and pushes in tension. It is a desire to belong that moves me. I don't know what moves me. A distant melancholy of longing for something. I hope to find it within the movement of my body. I walk through its long corridors and squared rooms. Do they finish somewhere? Do they lead anywhere? I don't know. Infinite tunnels of bureoucracy expanding through my limbs. Breath becomes difficult. I'm in a room. I'm in the spotlight. I wear a very long green dress…. I'm sexy in a woman's dress with my hairy chest. I'm influenced by melodramatic movies. I'm soft and sensual. I'm taking over the the audience with my

gaze but you are on the left. I see you. I chase you with my fucktatious eyes. Sometimes I feel like a God, other times I become the pornographic Aphrodite. I suddenly remember a scene from the musical „Mal Educacion". I cannot feel the existance of other bodies. With my eyes open, I feel alone…

CHORE
PER
THEATRE PRACT
DEDISCIPLINED BC
DIGITAL PERF
CHC
PERFORMANCE A
THI
DEDIS
CH
PERFORMA
THEATRE
DEDISCIPLINED BC
DIGITAL PERFORMANC
CHOREOG